

OPTIONS SUMMARY SHEET

Date of Appraisal: 1 December 2005

Issue: Maximising the use of previously developed land for new housing

Policy SH3 (formerly Emerging Options H2b; H2c (partly); H2d; preferred option PH2)

- A. Priority will be given to the development of previously developed sites and no more than 10% of dwellings granted permission will be on greenfield sites in any five-year period between 2004/05 and 2025/26.

In the period to 2025/26, housing on greenfield sites will be developed only:

- at Owlthorpe;
- in the Housing Market Renewal Area and other housing renewal areas where it is essential for the effective regeneration of the area and adequate open space would be retained to meet local needs; and
- exceptionally, on small sites within the existing urban areas and larger villages, where it can be justified on sustainability grounds.

Rejected Options

- B. No housing development on any greenfield sites, regardless of the value of the open space and the provision of open space in the local area (formerly emerging option H2a)
- C. Retain existing UDP – development on greenfield sites considered against open space/Green Belt policies, plus development on UDP allocated greenfield sites

Sustainability Objective	Policy			Rejected Options			Comments
	A	B	C	A	B	C	
1. A strong economy with good job opportunities available to the whole community	0	0	0				
2. Education and training opportunities which build the skills and capacity of the population	0	0	0				
3. Decent housing available to everyone (including vulnerable people and disadvantaged groups)	✓✓	X	X				A - Facilitates renewal of unfit or low demand housing and enables estate redevelopment which will improve the housing offer. Could help to provide small sites for affordable housing. B/C - Potentially hinders renewal of unfit/low demand housing by being too inflexible to allow for land swaps or estate layout alteration.
4. Conditions and services which engender good health	✓	✓	✓				A/B/C - Open space generally beneficial for mental well-being/exercise – all options protect <u>valuable</u> open space but policy provides more scope to reinvest money from development to create/improve public open space.
5. Safety and security for people and property	✓✓	XX	0				A – Reconfiguration of estates in HMR area could improve security for residents. B – Likely to limit opportunities to improve the safety of open spaces in some areas.
6. Good cultural, leisure and recreation facilities available to all	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓				A – No negative impact provided that adequate alternative public open space is available. Development at Owlthorpe has potential recreational benefits as S106 money from the housing development could fund completion of the public open space network. B – Safeguards all recreational open space, although it may limit

Sustainability Objective	Policy			Rejected Options			Comments
	A	B	C	A	B	C	
							scope to improve poor quality open space. C – Current plan safeguards recreational open space.
7. Land use patterns that minimise the need to travel or which promote the use of sustainable forms of transport	✓✓	X	X				A– Makes more efficient use of urban land – urban sites more likely to be close to local facilities thereby increasing opportunities for walking/ cycling. Owlthorpe sites are relatively close to the Supertram network but are more than easy walking distance from local shops. Provision of a local convenience store as part of the development would improve sustainability. B – Potentially wasteful in terms of use of urban land as unused sites would be left undeveloped. Protection of greenfield sites within the urban area is likely to increase pressure for development on less accessible sites outside the urban area. C – Would mean more greenfield development on the edge of the city on sites less well served by public transport. However, impact could be mitigated by new services.
8. An efficient transport network which maximises access and minimises detrimental impacts	✓	✓	X				A – Concentrates majority of development on previously developed land, which is likely to be in the urban area, and some greenfield sites in the main urban area. Generally this will make efficient use of the public transport network and improve viability of services. Greenfield sites at Owlthorpe enable efficient use of existing Supertram services. C – More development on edge of city means it is less likely to support viability of public transport.
9. Efficient use of land which makes good use of previously developed sites and buildings	✓✓	✓✓	✓				A – Very limited greenfield development. The limited greenfield development that is permitted would be unlikely to divert development away from previously developed sites

Sustainability Objective	Policy	Rejected Options			Comments
		A	B	C	
					<p>B – Would maximise use of previously developed land but some unused low quality greenfield sites in the urban area would remain disused.</p> <p>C – No emphasis in current UDP to concentrate on previously developed land though this is a requirement of PPG3.</p>
10. A quality built environment	✓✓	0	0	0	A – Facilitates replacement of poor housing of low visual quality or unsustainable design by enabling estate reconfiguration by allowing limited greenfield development as part of housing market renewal.
11. Historic environment protected and enhanced	0	0	0	0	
12. Quality of natural landscapes maintained and enhanced	✓	✓✓	XX		<p>A – Concentration of development on previously developed land with some limited greenfield development within urban areas will have a positive impact on protecting natural landscapes. However, development at Owithorpe would result in visual intrusion into open countryside, although effective landscaping could mitigate this.</p> <p>B – Prevents any intrusion into open countryside.</p> <p>C – Development of all allocated greenfield sites would lead to significant intrusion into countryside.</p>
13. Wildlife and important geological sites conserved and enhanced	X	✓/X	XX		<p>A - Could have minor negative impact on certain sites but this could be off-set by habitat creation/better management of remaining areas.</p> <p>B – Some previously developed may be of higher ecological value than many greenfield sites.</p> <p>C – Some of the allocated greenfield sites have wildlife value.</p>
14. Soil resources conserved	✓✓	✓✓	X		A - Concentrates majority of development on previously developed sites. Would involve some loss of soil resources on any greenfield

Sustainability Objective	Policy		Rejected Options		Comments
	A	B	B	C	
					<p>sites developed but overall impact likely to be insignificant. Likely to lead to reclamation of contaminated sites.</p> <p>B – Safeguards soils and means all development has to be on previously developed sites which is likely to lead to reclamation of many contaminated sites.</p> <p>C – Generally prevents development on greenfield sites but UDP still contains some significant greenfield sites; development of these would have a negative impact on soil quality.</p>
15. Water resources protected and enhanced	✓	✓	✓	X	<p>A/B – Both strictly limit greenfield development so impact on the whole is positive.</p> <p>C – Generally prevents development on greenfield sites but UDP still contains some significant greenfield sites; development of these likely to have some impact on run-off and ground water.</p>
16. Air pollution and greenhouse gas emissions minimised and a managed response to the effects of climate change	✓	✓	✓	✓	<p>A/B – Both options limit the scope for urban expansion meaning that more development is located in urban areas where there is more potential to use less polluting modes of transport, although higher populations in urban areas could lead to greater congestion.</p> <p>C – Some expansion of urban areas in areas less well served by public transport but could have local air quality benefits by dispersing congestion.</p>
17. Minimal risk to human life and property from flooding	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	X	<p>A/B - Both options generally protect undeveloped land which means no loss of flood water storage areas.</p> <p>C – Greenfield development could impact on flood storage areas and increase run-off.</p>

Sustainability Objective	Policy	Rejected Options			Comments
		A	B	C	
18. Prudent and efficient use of energy and mineral resources	0	0	0	0	
19. Minimal production of waste and the reuse, recycling and recovery of waste maximised	0	0	0	0	
20. Efficient use of physical infrastructure	✓	✓	✓/X		<p>A – Impact depends, to some extent, on particular site. At Owlthorpe, main justification for development on these sites is to make more efficient use of existing infrastructure or to secure delivery of additional infrastructure needed to support housing that has already been built. Infrastructure more likely to be in place already within the main urban area where most development will take place.</p> <p>B – All development on previously developed land which will generally already have existing services and infrastructure.</p> <p>C – Expansion onto greenfield sites likely to mean new infrastructure is needed.</p>